

Minutes of 28 September 1998  
Circulated 29 September 1998  
Approved 19 October 1998

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN  
SENATE ASSEMBLY MEETING  
MINUTES OF 28 SEPTEMBER 1998

ATTENDANCE

**Present:** B. Bleske, M. Bonner, A. Burdi, R. Christiansen, L. Colletti, K. Cooney, R. Dunkle, W. Ensminger, M. Foss, I. Francis, K. Freese, R. Gull, J. Hart, A. Jensen, B. Karnopp, L. Kleinsmith, S. Kossoudji, A. Lauffer, J. Lawson, M. Lomax, C. Loveland-Cherry, B. MacAdam, G. MacAlpine, M. Maehr, A. Malkawi, J. Merchant, M. Navvab, J. Rahme, J. Raisler, R. Robertson, P. Rogers, M. Rosenthal, J. Rush, J. Scheiman, M. Schneider, D. Schteingart, M. Shapiro, R. Sharf, R. Sharp, M. Sheil, J. Shotwell, K. Taylor, S. Teasley, J. Turcotte, P. Ward, F. Whitehouse Jr., G. Winger, E. Wingrove, S. Wright, C. Yocum, J. Zorn

**Alternates:** Joseph Flynn (for Aileen Sedman, Medicine), Caroline Gaither (for Steven Erickson, Pharmacy), Deborah Walker (for Seonae Yeo, Nursing)

**Absent:** R. Bartlett, L. Bernal, J. Boyd, D. Burns, V. Castle, D. Deskins, M. Feldman, K. Jamerson, S. Julius, P. Kabamba, S. Lafortune, D. Lee, D. Malamud, R. Mann, N. Marshall, Y. Murphy, L. Nagel, S. Nolen-Hoeksema, M. Rosano, V. Rosenberg, R. Thum, T. Wagaw,

**Guests:** S. Karnik (MSA Liaison)

MATERIALS DISTRIBUTED

1. Agenda for 28 September 1998
2. SACUA and Senate Assembly Skeletal Agendas
3. Draft Minutes of 18 May 1998
4. Approved Minutes of 20 April 1998
5. Approved Minutes of 16 March 1998
6. Approved Minutes of 16 February 1998
7. Approved Minutes of 26 January 1998
8. Faculty Governance Update, September 1998
9. Senate Assembly membership list 1998-1999
10. The University of Michigan's Ann Arbor Campus Code of Student Conduct
11. new member nominations for Senate Assembly committees

Chair Ensminger convened the meeting at 2:00 P.M. He welcomed both new and returning members of the Senate Assembly, and he reviewed the structure of the Assembly, as well as its advisory committee structure. He encouraged Assembly members to participate in the committees. At 2:03 P.M., Chair Ensminger invited President Lee C. Bollinger to address the Assembly.

REMARKS BY PRESIDENT BOLLINGER

President Bollinger presented an overview of university affairs. He began with discussion of financial matters. He reported that the Medical Center, which accounts for \$1 billion of the total university budget of \$3 billion, has avoided the fiscal crisis that had been feared. He said the Center

was operating in the black at present. He said that finances had improved through cost cuts, reorganization of the practice of medicine, and by engaging in partnerships with all kinds of groups.

President Bollinger advised Assembly members that Executive Vice President for Medical Affairs Omenn would be quoted that day in newspapers as saying that he hopes to reintroduce M-Care steerage for faculty and staff. The president added that nothing will happen on the resurrected steerage proposal until it comes through the president's office and there is ample opportunity for discussion. Bollinger said that he personally has no position on the proposal.

President Bollinger reported that in addition to the Medical Center revenues, the U-M receives 320 to 350 million dollars per year from the State of Michigan, which accounts for about 37% of the so-called General Fund, or about 12% of total revenues. The president said that federal revenues, mostly from National Institute of Health grants, account for substantial funding. He noted that both parties of Congress seemed presently in a race to increase the budget of the NIH, with increases of 9 percent or more per annum, and an anticipated doubling of the total NIH funding base.

The president said that the endowment and its investment income has grown, but that further improvement was possible. He explained that the endowment presently stood at \$2 billion, but that other schools have threefold or sixfold larger endowments. He cited rates of growth for State funding of 4% per year, for tuition 2% per year, endowment 17% per year, and grants 2 to 3% per year. He said that the overall revenue stream was growing at 5 to 7% per year overall, versus 15 to 20% per year among major private universities. He stated that the differential growth rates portend growing disparity between great private universities and the public University of Michigan. He cited evidence that LSA faculty members have recently been recruited away with salary offers on average 45% higher.

President Bollinger said that the main competition for university funding at the State level has become the Prison System. He pointed out that 40,000 prisoners were currently incarcerated in the State, but that the number was projected to rise to 70,000 by the year 2005. He said that universities must make better cases for themselves to the State, and must grapple with the social policy decisions that are leading to extreme rates of incarceration at great public cost.

The president said that there is widespread feeling expressed that the cost of higher education is out of control, with resulting insistence that colleges not raise tuition above the Consumer Price Index. He said there was no logic to the prescription. He explained that the University of Michigan had been built up after World War II by State of Michigan expenditures that expressly recognized the need for revenue increases much greater than the CPI.

President Bollinger said that he has transferred \$4 million per year from the administrative and business side of university operation over to the academic side. He said that he hoped federal resources would grow fast enough to meet university needs. He also said that the institution must be prepared for private development. He said the endowment was building at \$200 million per year, but that it was just a beginning, and that another capital campaign would likely begin 2 to 5 years from now.

The president said that he and the provost believe that faculty compensation is inadequate in many parts of the university. He expressed the need for more funding for research and speaker series, as well. He said that undergraduate education also deserved attention, and that opportunities for small seminars and undergraduate research must be increased. He also said that core institutions, including the libraries, the Rackham building, and Hill Auditorium, required the commitment of funds for renovation.

Turning next to the physical environment, President Bollinger said that we were fortunate to have Denise Scott Brown and Robert Venturi working on the Master Plan. He said they know the

needs of higher education owing to their great experience at other campuses. He said that given the scale of this institution it is critical to have a long term, overarching view. He said that initial efforts would focus on the North Campus and on some parts of the Medical School. He said that he and the Provost were concerned about physical obstacles to future connections planned between the Medical School and LSA.

Turning next to the academic environment, President Bollinger said that academic developments are very much faculty driven, and that the key is finding the best people. He singled out the expected report from the Life Sciences Commission, which he characterized as a major thing to his thinking. He said that the pending initiative was not limited to biology and medicine, but encompassed social science, business, law, and ethics. He said that his administration was setting aside resources to contribute to the initiative.

President Bollinger then remarked that racial and other forms of diversity are crucial to a great university. He reported that litigation about university admission practices was now in the deposition stage and that trial was scheduled for the summer. He said that his administration views the dispute as a matter of great principle, and that therefore no settlement seems likely.

The president next announced that his office will henceforth co-sponsor the Academic Freedom Lecture Series developed originally by the Senate Assembly in reaction to treatment of Professors Davis, Markert, and Nickerson at the University of Michigan during the 1950s. Bollinger declared that the professors had been unjustly treated by this institution in an era of rabid intolerance. He said that the Regents are fully supportive of the decision to co-sponsor the lecture series.

Regarding the Senate Assembly recommendation to divest from tobacco stocks, President Bollinger said that a clash of principles was involved. One principle was not to do harm, and not to contribute to damage of human life and health. The other principle was not to become politicized. He said that at the time the Regents decided to divest from South African stocks, they established a procedure for future actions of the sort. He said that a committee would have to be charged to find out if there is deep and widespread concern with the university policy. He said that he, the Provost, the CFO, and the EVPMA were now prepared to bring the issue to the groups with which they interact, and to engage discussion. He said that he personally would bring the issue to the MSA.

The president completed his remarks at 2:42 P.M. Professor Rosenthal then asked how the president could learn whether the cost cutting measures used at the Medical Center were leading to a loss of quality of patient care. President Bollinger acknowledged that costs inherently erect disincentives for good care, but that these are opposed by ethics at the Medical Center. He said that what is involved is the same as is needed in appointments of deans or chairs. He said that we want people who care deeply about medical care. He said that his own meetings with medical center physicians and administrators cause him to sense a deep concern for the quality of care and a wish to preserve quality. He said that he is more concerned about pressures on the research functions of the Medical Center. Professor Rosenthal replied that she did not disagree with Bollinger's assessment of attitudes, but that with changes in the organizational structure of the Center, the best intentions can still go awry. She explained that she presently served on the Medical Affairs Advisory Committee and that her concerns were growing deeper all the time.

Chair Ensminger thanked the president for his presentation, and the president left the meeting at 2:49 P.M.

#### REMARKS BY VICE PRESIDENT MAUREEN HARTFORD

Vice President for Student Affairs Hartford was introduced by Chair Ensminger at 2:50 P.M. She said that she wished to describe several initiatives within her office. She pointed out that she has

been working effectively with her Senate Assembly advisory committee, and that the work has led to the preparation of a report and also to detailed discussion with the Master Planners.

The vice president said that binge drinking was a concern on this campus, as elsewhere. She said that good action plans were needed, and that she has a task force working on recommendations that should be ready by the end of the year. She said she will share the report with the Senate Assembly through SACUA.

Hartford said that another effort by her office has been to increase responsiveness to student emergencies.

The vice president also provided a brief history of the present Student Code, and she reported that its implementation was currently under a review mandated by the Regents. She said that an internal process consisting of mail inquiries, telephone interviews, and focus group surveys would be completed by late October, and that an external review committee would visit in November.

At 3:00 P.M. Hartford invited questions from the audience. Mr. Karnik, MSA representative to the Senate Assembly, stated that the students wanted to have the Code itself reviewed, not just its implementation. Vice President Hartford replied that review of the Code was not her charge from the Regents. She suggested that MSA could, however, provide its own comments to the Regents as it wished.

Professor Snyder asked how quality control was exercised in Living-Learning programs. Hartford replied that the academic programs are designed through schools or colleges and that selection of faculty is through the unit level. Professor Zorn commented that the history of the programs shows that over time, teaching is transferred progressively to non-tenured lecturers. Provost Cantor remarked that she had met earlier in the day with deans and had discussed the subject. She said that she was going to look further at the extent to which schools are willing to commit their regular faculty to the programs. Professor Zorn replied that budget pressures on units eventually cause senior faculty involvement to be reduced. Provost Cantor replied that she knew that, and that we need to make an institutional commitment to the programs.

Chair Ensminger thanked Vice President Hartford for her presentation at 3:07 P.M. The vice president said that she would be pleased to return for further discussion if needed.

#### CONSIDERATION OF THE MINUTES OF 18 MAY 1998

The minutes of 18 May 1998 were approved.

#### OLD BUSINESS

Chair Ensminger announced that the Model Grievance Policy developed by Senate Assembly is being taken now for adoption at School and College level. He asked Provost Cantor to report on the progress to date. The provost replied that she has asked all deans to bring the policy to their faculty for vote within the next month or two. Professor Lawson asked if steps have been taken to distribute the policy to deans at Flint and Dearborn campuses. Ensminger replied that he had received communication earlier in the day from the provost at UM Flint which indicated that an attempt will be made to implement the relevant parts of the policy on that campus.

Chair Ensminger reported that a pending initiative was review of the Ombuds program in an effort to improve its effectiveness at problem resolution.

Chair Ensminger said that the Report on the Professoriate approved by the Senate Assembly will be discussed at a pending meeting of the Academic Programs Group, and that Senate Assembly would be represented at the meeting by the Academic Affairs Advisory Committee. Provost Cantor said that the report would be one item considered during a planned two day retreat.

Secretary Lehman reported the development of a Faculty Forum on Undergraduate Education, scheduled for 27 October 1998 at the Gerald R. Ford Presidential Library. Titled "Research Universities and the Undergraduate: Designing Education for the 21<sup>st</sup> Century" the program will feature presentations by Dr. Shirley Strum Kenny, President of SUNY Stony Brook and Dr. F. David Mathews, President of the Kettering Foundation and former U. S. Secretary of Health, Education and Welfare. The program will further include a faculty panel and an administration-government panel. The latter panel features UM Regent Olivia Maynard, President Lee Bollinger, U. S. Representatives Lynn Rivers and Vernon Ehlers, and NSF undergraduate education science advisor James Lightbourne. Tickets for the event are available on a first-come basis from the Senate Assembly office (764-0303).

#### COMMITTEE MEMBERSHIP

##### ACTION OF SENATE ASSEMBLY SA0998-1

Members from the floor moved, and seconded:

The Senate Assembly approves the proposed additional membership of 1998-99 Senate Assembly committees (item 11).

Vote on the Active Motion:

The motion was approved by voice vote, with no opposing votes, and with no abstentions of record.

#### NEW BUSINESS

Chair Ensminger reported that responses solicited from Senate Assembly members before the meeting confirmed that recommendations made in the CESF report of the previous year and the issue of expansion of the clinical faculty would be priority issues for the Senate Assembly in the present year. He invited additional recommendations from the floor. Professor Rosenthal asked if SACUA has investigated how well the advisory committees are working at a variety of levels. Ensminger replied that the suggestion was worthy of study. Another member stated that she would like to see a study of interdisciplinary efforts on the campus, but that she was not yet prepared to make a specific proposal. Professor Burdi suggested that a study should be conducted of admissions policies to learn if students are being admitted of the type that could easily transfer their academic experiences across unit divisions. Professor Kleinsmith pointed out that admissions practices are the provinces of individual schools. Burdi replied that affirmation of current practices would nonetheless be a useful point of information.

The meeting adjourned at 3:20 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

John T. Lehman  
Senate Secretary