

Minutes of 28 March 2011  
Circulated 28 March 2011  
Approved 4 April 2011

**THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN**  
**Senate Advisory Committee on University Affairs**  
6048 Fleming Administration Building  
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1340  
Phone: (734) 764-0303  
Fax: (734) 764-6564  
[www.sacua.umich.edu](http://www.sacua.umich.edu)

Approved Minutes: [www.sacua.umich.edu/sacua/sacua-minutes.html](http://www.sacua.umich.edu/sacua/sacua-minutes.html)

**MINUTES OF THE SACUA MEETING OF 28 MARCH 2011**

**Present:** Barald, Goldman, Kearfott, Lehman, Lusmann, Poe, Rothman (chair); Carr, Schneider

**Absent:** Navvab

**Guests:** Provost P. Hanlon, L. Monts (senior vice provost for academic affairs), K. Gibbons (provost office), *Michigan Daily* reporters, *University Record* reporter

Materials Distributed

1. Draft agenda
2. Draft minutes of the 7 March 2011 meeting of SACUA
3. [“U.S. Department of Education Publishes Proposed Regulations Addressing Program Integrity and Student Aid Programs”, Federal Update, #11, 28 June 2010.](#)
4. “The Credit Hour Problem”, by Daniel Luzer, [WashingtonMonthly.com](http://WashingtonMonthly.com), 24 February 2011.
5. Letter to the U.S. Dept of Education from Molly Corbett Broad, President, American Council on Education, dated 16 February 2011
6. [“Colleges Weigh In on Rules”, Inside Higher Ed.com, 4 August 2010.](#)
7. [“Department of Education Establishes New Student Aid Rules to Protect Borrowers and Taxpayers”, Dept. of Ed, 28 October 2010.](#)

The meeting was convened by Chair Rothman at 3:20 P.M. The agenda was approved.

CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES

The minutes of 7 March 2011 were approved as submitted.

No minutes exist from 14 March 2011 because the meeting failed to achieve quorum.

VISIT OF PROVOST

The provost, K. Gibbons, and L. Monts arrived at 3:15 P.M. The provost expressed sympathy at the passing of Professor R. Frost, member of SACUA.

**Dean and Director Searches-** Two dean searches are underway at different degrees of progress. A search committee will likely be established within a week for the dean of Art and Design. P. Courant has accepted an 18-month extension to his term as University Librarian, and F. Blouin, Jr. has agreed to serve an eighth term as director of the Bentley Historical Library.

**New Directives from the Department of Education-** Distributed items 3 and 4 refer to new guidance from the federal agency about definition of a student credit hour, although the precise language has not been received. The guidance suggests that one credit hour equates to one hour of classroom contact time plus two hours of work outside the classroom over a 15-week term, or an equivalent amount of (undefined) “learning outcomes.” Some academics have suggested that the bureaucratic definition may stymie innovative styles of learning, by essentially reducing a credit hour to the equivalent of “seat time.” SACUA members indicated that credit for research courses has been problematic over the years, but that didactic teaching in both lectures and laboratory courses provides a reasonable model that is widely emulated in the units. Chair Rothman said that he would prefer to learn the method used to arrive at the credit hour definition, specifically how much learning was expected. He observed that funding seems to be at the heart of the agency effort, and that steps to satisfy time expectations alone seem inappropriate in the academic context. Professor Lusmann remarked that it is impossible to be formulaic in the arts; he added that his assessment in the area of voice instruction (School of Music) is based on outcome, based on one-on-one instruction and lots of outside work. Professor Lehman asked if the provost was seeking formal advice from SACUA. The provost replied in the negative, but said that the discussion was helpful.

**Budget-** The provost offered to make a formal presentation on the university budget at a future meeting. SACUA accepted the offer. Chair Rothman observed that the governor’s budget seems to be shifting money from education to business. The provost replied that the proposed budget is a big challenge to the university, no question. He added that as citizens, everyone can raise their own voices and express personal opinions. He said that he viewed the proposed funding shift as permanent, noting that the U-M has endured the loss of \$162M in inflation-adjusted dollars over the past decade. He said that the result has been a shift of funding by about 10 percent from private sources (tuition and gifts/endowment) to replace lost public funds (sponsored research, state support) over the same decade.

**Administrative costs-** The provost responded to recent press reports about administrative costs at the U-M and other state universities by saying that he first needed to review the data because he is aware of allegations that the data are misrepresented. He said that \$300M for administrative salaries seems high to him, and he questions the employment categories that are included in that determination.

**Tenure Probationary Period-** Professor Lehman asked whether the provost still intended to ask the Board of Regents to alter Bylaw 5.09 in light of the University Senate vote of 21 March 2011. The provost said that he was still mulling it over and that he was receiving comments from many groups. He said that he would inform SACUA as soon as he decides whether to present it to the Regents in April. Professor Barald remarked that during a recent discussion of the matter in the Medical School, requests for data about the alleged problem with the existing probationary period were raised again, but no data were forthcoming. She said it was difficult to assess the

real motivating goals behind the proposal on the part of the Medical School or other proponents of the change. She said that inside the Medical School people who are not on the tenure track and who are defined as "executive faculty" are voting on issues of tenure. She noted that a Senate Assembly resolution of 24 January 2011 deprecating such practices was unanimous (56 to 0, with 1 abstention of record). She said she would forward relevant data she had collected to the provost.

The provost and K. Gibbons left the meeting at 4:00 P.M.

#### ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Rothman read a statement of tribute to Professor Frost and mourned his passing over the weekend. Individual members added their own sympathetic remarks. There will be a memorial service and a Frost Fund for Cancer Research. Professor Frost was the great-grandson of poet Robert Frost.

#### **Slate of candidates for honorary degree selection committee-**

Chair Rothman circulated a list of candidates that will be submitted to the president for possible membership on the committee that will select honorary degree recipients. He said that the list consisted of self-nominees supplemented by names he selected. He invited SACUA members to propose additional names by sending them to the Senate Office.

#### APRIL REGENTS UPDATE (4:10 P.M.)

SACUA members asked Professor Lehman to draft the April Regents' Update, due 8 April, and to include reference to votes taken by both SACUA and the Senate Assembly in addition to that of the University Senate on 21 March 2011.

#### SENATE MEETING FOLLOW-UP

SACUA members remarked that their Action Item 1 was interpreted ambiguously by members of the Senate. Professor Lehman asked why SACUA Action 013111-1, which had been announced to the University Senate, did not appear on the list of action items. Members indicated that SACUA had conducted a discussion in executive session on 7 March 2011 and had overturned its previous action. Professor Kearfott said that SACUA members decided to cancel the Senate meeting scheduled for 21 February 2011 as a result of telephone discussion.

---

#### ACTION OF SACUA 032811-1

SACUA ratifies its action to postpone the University Senate meeting of 21 February 2011.

Number approving- 5

Number disapproving- 1

Abstentions of record- 0

---

---

#### ACTION OF SACUA 032811-1

Professor Lehman moved that SACUA commend the issue of alternative methods of voting by faculty governance bodies to the Rules Committee (Goldman seconded). Professor Poe offered a

friendly amendment that the Rules Committee be expanded to five members of the University Senate as soon as practicable.

The action was approved by unanimous vote. Nominations for membership on the Rules Committee should be transmitted to the Senate Office before the next SACUA meeting.

---

Professor Lehman offered to supply SACUA with a tally of senators who attended the Senate meeting of 21 March aggregated by unit.

SACUA asked the chair to investigate the use of Rackham Senate Hall (Amphitheatre) or Rackham Auditorium for future Assembly and Senate meetings.

#### LIAISON REPORTS

**Financial Affairs** (Professor Barald)- The committee received a report about the university budget from the University Comptroller. If indirect costs and some direct costs of sponsored projects are used to help balance the budget, problems will arise as the federal sources dwindle. No solution was proposed. Discussion of the university telephone system was postponed; voice-over-IP is an option; so is the use of cellular phones to replace land lines, except in emergency phones, particularly in dormitories.

**Student Relations** (Professor Goldman)- The committee met on 18 March and received an update from the director of Recreational Sports. The committee also learned of federal legislation regarding cases under Title IX that could mandate investigations even if victims have not authorized them.

**General Counsel** (Professor Goldman)- The committee met on 21 March and discussed trespass policy plus compliance issues.

**Civil Liberties Board** (Professor Lehman)- The committee met the General Counsel earlier in the day regarding proposed revisions to trespass policy. No text of proposed revisions was provided. Significant concerns were expressed about review and appeal provisions. Chair Rothman added that he had made recommendations to the General Counsel directly. Professor Lehman conveyed a complaint from the CLB that SACUA has not brought significant issues to them and that they were considering a request to be disbanded as a result.

**AAAC** (Professors Kearfott and Poe)- (1) The committee has made a recommendation to the provost regarding expanded detail for course descriptions. (2) More interaction is recommended among LSA, the provost, and AAAC over budget problems in International Studies. (3) A recommendation has been sent to the provost saying that a case has not been made with the faculty sufficient to justify the proposed extension of the tenure probationary period, nor has there been a clear explanation of what the problem is from the perspective of the administration.

**Secretary of University** (L. Carr)- The committee is reviewing an SPG about bullying.

#### OLD BUSINESS

There was no old business.

NEW BUSINESS

There was no new business.

The meeting adjourned at 5:08 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

John Lehman  
Senate Secretary

**University of Michigan Bylaws of the Board of Regents, Sec. 5.02:**

*Governing Bodies in Schools and Colleges*

In each school, college, or degree granting division of the University, including those at the University of Michigan-Dearborn and at the University of Michigan-Flint, the governing faculty shall be in charge of the affairs of the school, college, or division, except as delegated to the executive committee, if any, and except that in the School of Graduate Studies the governing board shall be the executive board, and in the Medical School shall be the executive faculty.

###