

Minutes of 31 July 2006
Circulated 31 July 2006
Re-circulated 23 August 2006
Approved 28 August 2006

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
Senate Advisory Committee on University Affairs
6048 Fleming Administration Building
Ann Arbor, Michigan 48109-1340
Phone: (734) 764-0303
Fax: (734) 764-6564
www.sacua.umich.edu

Approved Minutes: www.sacua.umich.edu/sacua/sacua-minutes.html

MINUTES OF THE SACUA MEETING OF 31 JULY 2006

Present: Frier, Giordani, Meerkov, Potter, Riles, Seabury, Smith (chair); Lehman, Leu, Schneider

Absent: Combi, MacAdam

Guests: Mary Sue Coleman, Teresa Sullivan

MATERIALS DISTRIBUTED:

1. Draft Agenda
2. [Regents Bylaw 5.09](#)
3. Draft minutes of the portion of the SACUA meeting of 17 July 2006 covering the visit of Provost Sullivan reviewed by her and returned on 25 July 2006
4. Draft minutes of the SACUA meeting of 24 July 2006
5. "[U-M faculty views slighted, group contends: Resolution complains about Coleman reappointment process](#)", 21 July 2006 Ann Arbor News article by Dave Gershman
6. Electronic mail message exchange between Regent Laurence Deitch and SACUA Chair Charles B. Smith dated from 19 July 2006 through 29 July 2006 regarding the reconstruction of Michigan Stadium
7. "[Stadium renovation plans accessible online: Ann Arbor residents, marching band members discuss their feelings on designs for stadium renovation project](#)", 31 July 2006 Michigan Daily article by Leah Graboski
8. [Michigan Stadium Renovation](#) home page
9. Michigan Stadium Renovation [Project Description](#) page
10. Michigan Stadium Renovation [Proposed Site Plans](#) dated 28 July 2006
11. Electronic mail message exchange between SACUA Chair Charles B. Smith and Karen Gibbons dated 26-27 July 2006 regarding a study group
12. Electronic mail message from Professor Riles to SACUA and AAAC dated 29 July 2006 regarding the AAAC liaison report to SACUA
13. Electronic mail message from AFLF President Peggie J. Hollingsworth to Charles B. Smith dated 24 July 2006 regarding DMN Selection Committee Bylaws/July 21, 2006
14. Davis, Markert, Nickerson Visiting Professorship on Academic and Intellectual Freedom 2006-2009 Selection Committee

15. University of Michigan Regents Communication requesting establishment of the Davis, Markert, Nickerson Visiting Professorship on Academic and Intellectual Freedom effective September 2005 and approved by the Regents 19 May 2005
16. [Page from the Proceedings of the Board of Regents May Meeting 2005](#) with the Establishing a Named Professorship - Davis, Markert, Nickerson Visiting Professorship on Academic and Intellectual Freedom, Horace H. Rackham School of Graduate Studies, September 1, 2005
17. [Letter from President Mary Sue Coleman](#) to [then] SACUA Chair Bruno J. Giordani dated 27 June 2005 regarding the committee to recommend candidates for the Davis, Markert, Nickerson Visiting Professorship on Academic and Intellectual Freedom
18. Electronic mail messages dated 29 July 2006 from Professor Frier and Professor Riles regarding Lino Graglia as a potential for the Davis, Markert, Nickerson Lecture
19. "[Right On! - An Academic Lynching – why a veteran professor of law is being strung up for saying the obvious](#)", Salon Magazine article dated 22 September 1997 by David Horowitz [regarding Lino Graglia]
20. [Nat Hentoff biography](#) from The Washington Post Company
21. Amazon.com information about [The Nat Hentoff Reader](#)
22. Electronic mail message dated 26 July 2006 from Professor Frier to SACUA Chair Charles B. Smith regarding a disclaimer
23. SACUA/Senate Assembly Planning Schedule, updated 28 July 2006

Chair Smith convened the meeting at 1:45 P.M.; the draft agenda was approved. SACUA members prepared for the visit of the university president.

EXECUTIVE SESSION- VISIT OF UNIVERSITY PRESIDENT

The president and provost arrived at 2:00 P.M. for discussion of a personnel matter. The guests left the meeting at 2:30 P.M.

CONSIDERATION OF MINUTES

The provisionally approved minutes of 17 July 2006 were approved for distribution. The minutes of 24 July 2006 were approved.

ANNOUNCEMENTS

The chair announced:

1. The Ann Arbor News article discussed at the SACUA meeting of 24 July is included in distributed materials.
2. SACUA will meet next on 28 August 2006.
3. The chair will meet with CFO Slottow on 16 August. He will attempt to learn if the U-M would be willing to restore Medicare B benefits to retirees who were affected retroactively by their withdrawal.
4. Regent Deitch has communicated with SACUA and offered to meet. One possible date is 28 August. SACUA members authorized the chair to arrange a meeting.
5. The provost has provided a memorandum saying that a faculty committee will be set up to act as an advisory committee on university data. No additional information is available yet.

COMMITTEE LIAISON REPORTS

Intercollegiate Advisory-

Professor Potter reported that the committee heard from athletic director Martin regarding progress of planning for renovation of Michigan Stadium. Martin stated that he plans to sell the naming rights for the four access routes to the Stadium, figuring that will net \$28 million for the project. The board also considered a situation at Auburn University wherein massive use of independent study courses was used to be sure that the university could field a football team. A review is now being conducted at the U-M to assure that such practices do not occur here.

AAAC Student Academic Success Study-

Professor Riles reported that most of the subcommittee met on 25 July with provost Terry Sullivan, Lester Monts, Ted Spencer, several members of Ted's staff, including his database expert, Larry Hoezee, Derek Collins, and Bill Schultz. John Lehman also attended as an observer. There was much discussion about the merits of carrying out the study, its timing, and the limitations from examining only numerical pre-admissions indicators.

The provost stipulated that the subcommittee's model is necessarily mis-specified because the information available in the database is incomplete. But she also said that since her predecessor had agreed to AAAC's carrying out the study, the study can proceed. She expressed concern there was not more information captured in the database concerning the factors that contribute to admissions. Members were shown a checklist used by applications readers, listing more than 40 considerations, but only a small fraction of those items are recorded electronically.

Ted Spencer shared guidelines for readers of LSA and Engineering applications that were quite informative. He emphasized repeatedly the small number of his staff who can assist with the study; he wanted to minimize the demand on their time.

It turns out, however, that an organization called Center for Equal Opportunity (CEO) filed a FOIA request recently for a large amount of U-M admissions data for the years 1999 and 2003-2005. It appears that CEO paid for the costs of assembling the data. To save time and effort, the subcommittee agreed to work with information about students in that data set for the time being, merging that data set with items derived from the Registrar's Office database. That would yield four years of student information instead of the ten years originally requested, although it gives only one year for which 6-year graduation rates can be computed. Nonetheless, the data may yield important insights into the effects of our admissions policies. After examining the data, the AAAC may, of course, decide to renew the request for the full 10 years of student data.

At the end of the meeting, the provost asked Professor Riles to work with Larry Hoezee to obtain the data. Hoezee subsequently provided the CEO data set to Irfan Bhabhrawala in the Registrar's Office. Irfan has stated that on 2 August he would provide an estimate about when the merged dataset will be ready for us. Registrar Paul Robinson has provided assurances that his office would cooperate fully with our study.

On the whole, this recent progress seems encouraging.

DAVIS, MARKERT, NICKERSON LECTURE AND PROFESSORSHIP

Chair Smith reported that a joint committee is being constituted by the AAUP and the Academic Freedom Lecture Fund for review and revision of proposed rules for the operation of the

professorship. Professor Meerkov remarked that he thought it was deplorable that conservative voices are omitted from the selection committees for this lecture, and from the list of invitees. He said the practice was the antithesis of democracy.

ACTION OF SACUA 073106-1 The chair invited a motion that SACUA will participate in the joint committee through its chair. The motion was offered by several members simultaneously. The motion was approved unanimously.

Professor Meerkov asked whether George Will was on the list of potential invitees for the Academic Freedom Lecture. Chair Smith confirmed that he was. Professor Meerkov asked when the invitation would be made. The chair replied that the choice was not up to him. Professor Frier expressed concern that a full list of nominations be placed on the table before selections are made.

EXPANSION OF ADVISORY COMMITTEES

Chair Smith reminded members that interest has been expressed in the idea of expanding the range of Senate Assembly advisory committees to include one on benefits oversight and on information technology. Members reacted positively and encouraged the chair to pursue possible courses of action.

Professor Frier pointed out that there is already difficulty populating several of the Assembly committees. Chair Smith invited volunteers for a subcommittee to evaluate the current committee structure. Members discussed several model solutions, but no resolution was achieved.

LEGAL DISCLAIMER

Professor Frier suggested that SACUA may want to develop a disclaimer about its legal limitations when providing advice to faculty grievants. He said it was important not to give the impression that SACUA's advice could substitute for that of an attorney. The chair asked Mr. Schneider to draft such a disclaimer.

OLD/NEW BUSINESS

The chair reported that the provost has responded to a communication from the SACUA chair expressing concern that a grievance review board chair is more than a month delinquent in preparation of a GRB report. The reply from the provost acknowledged that key deadlines have been severely exceeded by the GRB and particularly its chair, but claimed there was little more that could be done.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

The meeting entered executive session at 4:10 P.M. to discuss specific aspects of the GRB case.

The meeting resumed open session at 4:25 P.M.

ACTION OF SACUA 073106-2 SACUA unanimously authorized the chair to pursue the delinquency of a GRB committee report further with the provost as something that appears on the surface to be a case of serious malfeasance by the GRB chair, potentially more serious than the personnel matter brought earlier in the meeting by the president.

EXECUTIVE SESSION

The meeting entered executive session at 4:30 P.M. to consider nominations for membership on committees, committee chairs, and committee liaisons.

The meeting adjourned at 5:00 P.M.

Respectfully submitted,

John Lehman
Senate Secretary

University of Michigan Bylaws of the Board of Regents, Sec. 5.02:

Governing Bodies in Schools and Colleges

In each school, college, or degree granting division of the University, including those at the University of Michigan-Dearborn and at the University of Michigan-Flint, the governing faculty shall be in charge of the affairs of the school, college, or division, except as delegated to the executive committee, if any, and except that in the School of Graduate Studies the governing board shall be the executive board, and in the Medical School shall be the executive faculty.