

Minutes: DATE: 13 December 2021
Circulated DATE 19 January 2022
Approved DATE 24 January 2022

THE UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN
Senate Assembly
Monday, 13 December 2021, Time 3:15-5:00
The meeting was held Virtually via ZOOM

Present: Admon, Atzmon (by virtue), Barzilai, Bawardi, Braun, Bridwell-Rabb, Brown, Burton, Burzo, Cho, DiFeo, Dinov, Dolins, Duanmu, Evrard, Finlayson (by virtue), Fontana, Fossum (Parliamentarian), Friese, Girard, Gnedin, Hertz, Huang, Hyde, Jenkins, Junghans, Kahn, Kaur, Ketefian, Knoblauch, Kovelman, Lagisetty, Lampe, Lepri, Lin, Liu, MacLatchy, Madathilparambil, Maitra, Maxim, Mesa, Modrak, Partridge (by virtue), Pedraza, Peterson, Pinto, Price, Ramaswamy, Rickard, Singer, Soderstrom, Spencer (by virtue) Stout, Toyama (by virtue), Traynor, Van Berkel, Wong, Zebrack

Alternate(s): Korley (Abir), Lucas (Hughes)

Absent: Ahbel-Rappe (by virtue), Burton, Conjeevaram, Conway (by virtue), Freeman (by virtue), Gallo (by virtue), Garner, Guikema, Guzdial, Indjejikian, Kaigler, Kazerooni, Lahiri, Laurence, Mansfield, Morgan, Okwudire, Pal, Price, Rauterberg, Rosentraub, Subramanian, Tanielian, Wang, Yi

Guests: Ann Zaniewski *University Record*; Irena Li *Michigan Daily*; President Mark Schlissel; Professor Robert Ziff, Chair of Development Advisory Committee; Professor Tom Braun Chair of Committee on Oversight of Administrative Action; Professor Elizabeth Armstrong, Sociology; Professor Sarah Daniels Associate Dean of Students; Geoff Chatas, Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Lynette Clemetson, Director Wallace House; Curtiss Wayne Engstrom, graduate student representative; Steve Yaros, Project Manager, Office of the President; Mike Solomon, Dean of Rackham Graduate School; Kaliana Flora Dejoie, undergraduate student representative Provost Selection and Appointment Committee; Laurie Kay McCauley, Dean of School of Dentistry; Sara Blair, Vice Provost for Academic and Faculty Affairs; Lauren Davis, Director of Diversity Equity and Community

Guests: Ann Zaniewski *University Record*; Irena Li *Michigan Daily*; President Mark Schlissel; Professor Robert Ziff, Chair of Development Advisory Committee; Professor Tom Braun Chair of Committee on Oversight of Administrative Action; Professor Elizabeth Armstrong, Sociology; Professor Sarah Daniels Associate Dean of Students; Geoff Chatas, Vice President and Chief Financial Officer; Lynette Clemetson, Director Wallace House; Curtiss Wayne Engstrom, graduate student representative; Steve Yaros, Project Manager, Office of the President; Mike Solomon, Dean of Rackham Graduate School; Kaliana Flora Dejoie, undergraduate student representative Provost Selection and Appointment Committee; Laurie Kay McCauley, Dean of School of Dentistry; Sara Blair, Vice Provost for Academic and Faculty Affairs; Lauren Davis, Director of Diversity Equity and Community

3:15: The meeting was called to order at 3:17. Chair Liu expressed appreciation for the Senate Assembly member's participation at this busy time. Live transcription was available during the meeting. Vice Chair Finlayson monitored the chat. Meeting minutes were also approved from two months ago. Chair Liu waited to see if there were objections or corrections from members regarding minutes. Seeing no raised hands or comments in the chat, minutes from October 11, 2021, were approved by consent at 3:19. Chair Liu indicated that President Mark Schlissel would share a COVID update later after listening to the senate assembly regarding the provost search.

3:20: Faculty Senate Office Updates: Director of the Faculty Senate Office MaryJo Banasik posted a position for a 60% FTE staff member. She plans to begin interviewing candidates and making a hiring decision early in the new year. On January 21, 2022, the university administration and the Faculty Senate Office will vacate the Fleming Building and move to the Ruthven Building.

3:25: SACUA Updates: Chair Liu presented a Faculty Senate update to the regents at their December 9, 2021 meeting. In response to the previously approved motions, Chair Allen Liu announced that a new working group was approved by SACUA to look into faculty issues and concerns related to Work Connections. Regarding COVID policies, the University may require booster shots for 'fully vaccinated' status, especially if CDC recommend having booster shots to be considered fully vaccinated.

Charges were established for a working group on Motion 4. The SPG 601.8 on felony reporting is up for review and will be brought before SACUA. The policy was established in 2019. Some faculty expressed concerns regarding the current president chairing the Provost search in light of the Philbert debacle.

3:30: President Schlissel and the Provost Search and Advisory Committee joined the meeting for a listening session: The President thanked Senate Assembly members in advance for our time. The following members of the committee were introduced: Professor Elizabeth Armstrong, Sociology; Professor Sarah Daniels, Associate Dean of Students; Geoffrey Chatas, Executive VP and Chief Financial Officer; Lynette Clemetson, Director of Wallace House; Curtiss Wayne Engstrom, doctoral student and research assistant; Steve Yaros, Senior Project Manager, Office of the President; Professor Michael Solomon, Dean of the Rackham Graduate School; Kaliana Flora Dejoie, undergraduate student representative; Laurie Kay McCauley, Dean of the School of Dentistry; Sara Blair, Vice Provost for Academic and Faculty Affairs; Lauren Davis, Director of Diversity, Equity and Community Environment and Sustainability; and, SACUA Chair Allen Liu who also serves on the committee.

The committee is considering a three-year appointment for the new provost. The first two years would overlap with the term of the current president, and one year would overlap with President Schlissel's successor. It could be difficult to recruit someone from outside who doesn't know who their boss would be. A three-year term would allow the interim provost to consider their situation for a year. This is what happened with Provost Martha Pollock and President Mary Sue Coleman Provosts usually move on to become presidents at other universities.

President Schlissel discussed the matter in detail with the Regents and others. The committee extended the deadline to accept applications. December 16, 2021, was a soft deadline. The position will be kept open until filled. The committee is conducting

outreach meetings with various groups of faculty and staff on campus, such as this one with Senate Assembly.

There will be a set of common questions for candidates. The committee will deliberate on the candidates and the questions to be asked. They will have Regents and other key individuals on campus talk to the final candidate(s). The committee is hoping to complete its work in February of 2022. The successful candidate would speak iteratively with Provost Collins and assume the position July 2022. A more fulsome 5-year term extension is possible. The committee would place more consideration on individuals with Michigan connections.

The question was asked: what qualities, values, and temperament should we be looking for in a provost? The person in this position is a chief budget officer who presents to the Regents. The position also supervises all the academic deans. The question was also asked: what are additional issues with which the provost should be well-versed? The committee needs to confer with those who can provide the best advice. What issues will they tackle and how can we help them? One faculty member commented that the University needs to ensure that the candidate is not a sexual predator and asked what precautions would be taken to ensure that this does not occur. What are the kinds of precautions that are needed to ensure this? The answer was that each person will be asked if they know of any information regarding such potential issues that should be brought forward. Academic Human Resources, locally and more broadly, support external background checks, however, individuals won't be asked to sign a loyalty oath. In addition, the Office of Equity Civil Rights and Title IX, Academic Human Resources, and the Department of Public Safety and Security would conduct external background checks.

Tom Braun Professor of Biostatistics, and Chair of the Committee on Oversight of Administrative Action (COAA) commented that administrators have not been formally evaluated by the faculty. Quantitative (numerical rankings to questions) and qualitative comments that are the results of the evaluations of administrators were never read by their supervisors nor applied to their evaluations. Qualitative comments are not widely distributed, nor are they included within the evaluation of administrators. President Schlissel said that he does receive the numerical info for the provost. He also said that the written comments are given to the person under review because that is how the faculty rules have set the process. However, by and large, the surveys are not read or reviewed or considered in administrative evaluations. Upon Professor Braun learning that survey data is not really used in their job evaluation, he asked the question of how are administrators going to be evaluated?

A faculty member asked if Provost Collins wanted to continue in the position. The provost decided to resign the position at the end of June 2022. In terms of desirable qualities for consideration, Professor Cliff Lampe proposed the following: (1.) Acumen to politically strategize. (2.) Leadership to build trust in the community. There are pandemic and other gulfs between and among schools and colleges. We are in fraught times with the Regents, and we need a political strategist with leadership qualities who can build community and reestablish trust.

A comment in chat said the selection process needs to allow for broader faculty input. Professor Hyde agreed with Professor Lampe, in that we need a good communicator. Also, these are challenging times with COVID, and transparency is needed. Professor

Hyde thought it was good that Provost Collins had a policy background. We need a consensus builder who supports faculty governance. A provost is needed to build a track record of trust in faculty governance. There is lots of distrust by faculty in leadership writ large.

Professor Ann Chih Lin thanked the committee and asked if the shorter-term appointment would discourage good applicants who want to be president of UM. Would the candidate be able to make their mark within three years? Would the transitional nature of the position discourage applicants?

According to President Schlissel, it is preferable if the values of the provost and president align. They don't have to agree on everything at first but, if they can be in alignment with each other, they can more easily reach consensus. They need a good, close working relationship. Unfortunately, some people just don't mesh. It would be a bad situation for a person who could be stuck in a poor working relationship. The Regents want them to make clear that a provost applicant could be considered for the position of president. The board's search is open, they are considering external and internal candidates as well as a sitting provost.

Professor Derek Peterson said LSA is asking new faculty to commit to DEI, and that it overlaps with the larger issue of the commitment to social justice. He asked if the search committee had considered a documented track record and commitment to DEI as a quality of the candidate. This was important when President Schlissel interviewed. Now there are broader concepts of social justice that are important to the campus. Although the committee has not yet met, they will be committed to these issues. Kailana Flora Dejoie made a point to say that DEI issues have impacted her experience on campus, and she is committed to diversity, equity and inclusion. Nominations are open for a few more days. Commitment to the advancement of women was another equity related issue that was brought forward. Chair Allen Liu suggested Senate Assembly take the president up on his offer to reach out to him directly.

A professor asked President Schlissel why he should be chairing the provost's search advisory committee. His response was that he doesn't normally chair searches, but it is his responsibility in this case. There is no way he could hire a provost without digging deeply. The committee will help but he is the person responsible for hiring and decision-making as part of his position's duties. Another professor reiterated that not only was a commitment to social justice important but excellence as well.

4:05: COVID Update: Chair Liu asked President Schlissel to update the group on the most recent COVID-19 policies as he had done for SACUA the previous week. The president said that our community is highly vaccinated, and people won't be admitted unless they come into compliance. Infection rates peaked at Halloween, then decreased. Rates increased after the MSU game, then declined again. Infection rates rose after Thanksgiving. Dorms were at full capacity, but the dorms were not having disease outbreaks. We are a highly vaccinated community. We have some cases of long COVID, which is not good. We are preparing to consider booster status. We must get information from the CDC on boosters in January and then we will then require them if applicable. UM is the smaller percentage of Washtenaw County outbreaks. Right now the UM community level is low. We have indoor mask requirements. Regarding case investigation, the next level is the development of seating charts for classrooms to make case investigation easier as well as more rigorous. Vaccinated asymptomatic folk could

be compelled to get a booster and/or test. Faculty and staff working winter commencement were vaccinated. We try to institutionalize some of what we've learned in a public health unit which works with the university community so that we have a playbook for future pandemics or such. Chair Liu asked about requiring testing if not vaccinated. Professor Hyde asked about requiring vaccination for sporting events. He is a basketball fan and wants tacit testing. Are spreads happening at our sporting events? President Schlissel said one member of his leadership team recently contracted COVID. The leadership team had to be tested and the person's case was investigated. We are trying to follow the guidance and act on behalf of ourselves and our families.

A professor pressed the issue of President Schlissel not chairing the search committee. Another professor asked if it were the president's leadership or his service on the committee that was problematic. The response from the former professor was that running the search compromises the trust that the broader university would have in the new provost.

Professor Pinto would like to have debriefs after meetings with the president and provost. Professor and Parliamentarian, Paul Fossum would be asked to adjudicate.

The question was also asked: what does DEI mean for that committee? The comment was made that the committee does not appear to be very diverse. Do they have the knowledge of diversity to speak on this? For 70% of people to understand and agree on the definition of diversity is unlikely. Another faculty member stated that they couldn't speak for the diversity of the committee either.

According to Professor Mesa, only the undergraduate student seemed particularly committed to diversity. A slight disagreement ensued regarding the importance of diversity on the committee. While some professors said it didn't make a difference since the president is the provost's boss, another professor said it did make a difference. Given an unranked list of candidates, there are some situations where the president ultimately makes the decision.

The committee makes recommendations, and the president doesn't usually override people at the beginning of the process.

It was strongly recommended by a faculty member that personnel not in the president's office should chair the committee. Another professor would like to go totally outside of the president's office for the search. It can be chaired by a faculty member or administrator not currently in the office of the president. Chair Liu asked if we could check this with Professor Fossum, as parliamentarian, and do a hand raise. Chair Liu asked if there was a way to do a 2/3rds vote required to pass a motion to have a vote on this. Professor Ketelian said that we should vote on the substance. Chair Liu suggested looking at if other schools have their president chairing the provost search. It was noted in the Zoom chat that Professor James Jackson chaired a provost search in 2005. Paul Fossum says that the statement that the president does not chair the committee is actually a resolution. This resolution language was set up to vote electronically at the present meeting.

Resolution: The Senate Assembly respectfully suggest that the Provost Search Committee should be chaired by a UM faculty member or a member of the administration who is not currently employed at the Office of the President.

4:15: Davis, Markert, Nickerson Committee and the Rules Policies and Procedures Committee had two separate charges to be voted on. The Faculty Governance Coordinator inserted a link to Simply Voting. (1.) The DMN charges were regarding selecting two lecturers, one for fall and one for winter, instead of just one lecturer as in the past. (2.) The RPP charge had to do with expanding the membership of Faculty Governance to include more non-tenure track faculty. (3.) The third motion was to remove the president and his office from the provost search committee entirely.

While the Faculty Senate Office was setting up the vote, we heard from Professor Robert Ziff, Chair of the Development Advisory Committee.

4:25: Development Advisory Committee, Chair Robert Ziff Update:
Professor Ziff made a specific request for programming ideas as chair of the DAC. He has served on SACUA and other committees but as chair of this committee he wanted programming ideas. He said their most recent meeting was interesting, and that there were several people from the Medical school as well as several librarians.

\$300 million was raised this year. Ideas for agenda items to see this year should be sent to his email: rziff@umich.edu He wants to hear from us regarding what the committee should cover.

Professor Ivo Dinov asked about investment portfolio information. Students looked at the investment portfolio and where the university invests. The endowment grows, but how does one assess if one is outperforming the market? He could not get an answer. Sometimes the investments are risk averse and conservative. CFO 's office knows more about this than Development.

Huge hedge fund managers manage huge accounts. They like more volatility. There are more incentives for single units, not cross units. They want to delay the campaign until the new president is here.

Mark Burns created the successful MCube funding project, which many faculty liked and wished would be offered again.

4:40: Committee on Oversight of Administrative Action Chair Tom Braun graciously agreed to postpone his presentation until the January 24, 2022 meeting.

Members waited for the results of Simply Voting regarding the issues below (reproduced from above):

- (1.) The DMN charges were regarding two lecturers, one for fall and one for winter instead of just one lecturer as in the past.
- (2.) The RPP charge had to do with expanding the membership of Faculty Governance to include more non-tenure track faculty.
- (3.) The motion was to remove the president and his office from the provost search committee entirely.

Voting Results Below: All three resolutions passed.

Yes-No-Abstain

35-2-7 DMN

37-2-5 RPP

25-12-4 Resolution



4:55: No Matters Arising

5:00: Adjourned

Respectfully Submitted

Deirdre D. Spencer
Secretary

University of Michigan Bylaws of the Board of Regents, Sec. 5.02:
Governing Bodies in Schools and Colleges

Sec. 4.01 The University Senate

"...[t]he Senate is authorized to consider any subject pertaining to the interests of the university, and to make recommendations to the Board of Regents in regard thereto. Decisions of the University Senate with respect to matters within its jurisdiction shall constitute the binding action of the university faculties. Jurisdiction over academic policies shall reside in the faculties of the various schools and colleges, but insofar as actions by the several faculties affect university policy as a whole, or schools and colleges other than the one in which they originate, they shall be brought before the University Senate."

Rules of the University Senate, the Senate Assembly and the Senate Advisory Committee on University Affairs:

Senate: "In all cases not covered by rules adopted by the Senate, the procedure in Robert's Rules of Order shall be followed."

Assembly: "The Assembly may adopt rules for the transaction of its business. In appropriate cases not covered by rules of the Assembly, the rules of the University Senate shall apply."

SACUA: "The committee may adopt rules for the transaction of its business."

University of Michigan Bylaws of the Board of Regents, Sec. 5.02:
Governing Bodies in Schools and Colleges

Sec. 4.01 The University Senate

"...[t]he Senate is authorized to consider any subject pertaining to the interests of the university, and to make recommendations to the Board of Regents in regard thereto. Decisions of the University Senate with respect to matters within its jurisdiction shall constitute the binding action of the university faculties. Jurisdiction over academic policies shall reside in the faculties of the various schools and colleges, but insofar as actions by the several faculties affect university policy as a whole, or schools and colleges other than the one in which they originate, they shall be brought before the University Senate."

Rules of the University Senate, the Senate Assembly and the Senate Advisory Committee on University Affairs:

Senate: "In all cases not covered by rules adopted by the Senate, the procedure in Robert's Rules of Order shall be followed."

Assembly: "The Assembly may adopt rules for the transaction of its business. In appropriate cases not covered by rules of the Assembly, the rules of the University Senate shall apply."

SACUA: "The committee may adopt rules for the transaction of its business."